



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

contingent, while the optative is a form to represent it as merely conceived; and the difference between them is one not of degree, but of kind. And in accordance with what has been said, the four classes of conditional sentences particular may properly be described, viewing them with reference to the manner in which the fact of supposition is presented, the first, $\epsilon\iota$ with the indicative, usually a primary tense, as a supposition relating to actual fact; the second, $\epsilon\iota$ with the indicative, secondary tense, as a supposition relating to contrary fact, or implying that the contrary is the truth; the third, $\epsilon\acute{\alpha}\nu$ with the subjunctive, as a supposition relating to contingent fact; and the fourth, $\epsilon\iota$ with the optative, as a supposition of conceived fact.

VII. — *On the Age of Xenophon at the Time of the Anabasis.*

By CHARLES D. MORRIS,

OF LAKE MOHEGAN, PEEKSKILL, N. Y.

THE biographies of Xenophon represent that he was born in B. C. 444 or 443, and that he was in consequence forty-three or forty-two years old at the time he joined the expedition of Cyrus. So far as I have been able to examine the current authorities, I do not find any who do not give their adhesion to this view. The life of Xenophon prefixed to the edition of Prof. Anthon, which is mainly taken from that in the Penny Cyclopaedia, that in the edition of Prof. Boise, that prefixed to Kühner's edition, and that in Smith's Dictionary of Biography, are unanimous on this point. These all acknowledge their obligations to a tract of C. G. Krüger, published at Halle in 1822, entitled "*De Xenophontis Vita Quaestiones Criticae*," which I have unfortunately been unable to procure or even to get a sight of, and I can in consequence deal with it only at second hand.* Sir G. C.

* Since this paper was read, Mr. A. Van Name, Librarian of Yale College, kindly sent me a volume containing a number of Krüger's philological papers, and among them this discussion of Xenophon's age. I find that the "lives" above referred to have extracted all that is of weight in it, and the perusal of it has not led me to alter my own opinion in any degree.

Lewis, also, in a note on a learned article in the *Classical Museum* (vol. ii. p. 17), says incidentally: "Xenophon was about forty-two years old in B. C. 401, and consequently was born about 443." Clinton, indeed, in his *Fasti Hellenici* (sub ann. 401), though he holds the same opinion, refers to a note in Mitford's *History of Greece*, in which the latter, rejecting the main authority for the current belief which I will quote presently, attempts to establish that Xenophon was not more than thirty years old at the time of the *Anabasis* by two arguments which Clinton quotes and of which the one cannot be verified and the other is not true. This is unfortunate for me, as I purpose to maintain the view which Mitford adopted and to press it even further than he did; and it is with reluctance that I am thus compelled to discredit by anticipation my own position. Moreover, Prof. Boise, still, I presume, following Krüger, refers to several of the points, which I shall adduce, only to reject their force. But I think that the present case is one in which the whole power of an argument is lost if it be merely alluded to and not stated in full, and therefore I hope you will allow me to consider as an open question one supposed to have been long ago settled, and to lay before you the evidence on both sides.

My own early impression of Xenophon's age at the time of the *Anabasis* was derived from a passage in Bacon's "Advancement of Learning," which I shall venture to read.

"And here it were fit to leave this point touching the concurrence of military virtue and learning; for what example would come with any grace after those two of Alexander and Caesar? were it not in regard of the rareness of circumstance that I find in one other particular, as that which did so suddenly pass from extreme scorn to extreme wonder; and it is of Xenophon the philosopher, who went from Socrates' school into Asia, in the expedition of Cyrus the younger against King Artaxerxes. This Xenophon at that time was very young, and never had seen the wars before; neither had any command in the army, but only followed the war as a voluntary, for the love and conversation of Proxenus his friend. He was present when Falinus came in message from

the great king to the Grecians, after that Cyrus was slain in the field, and they a handful of men left to themselves in the midst of the king's territories, cut off from their country by many navigable rivers and many hundred miles. The message imported that they should deliver up their arms and submit themselves to the king's mercy. To which message before answer was made, divers of the army conferred familiarly with Falinus; and amongst the rest Xenophon happened to say, 'Why, Falinus, we have now but these two things left, our arms and our virtue! and if we yield up our arms, how shall we make use of our virtue?' Whereto Falinus, smiling on him, said, 'If I be not deceived, young gentleman, you are an Athenian, and I believe you study philosophy, and it is pretty that you say; but you are much abused, if you think your virtue can withstand the king's power.' Here was the scorn; the wonder followed; which was that this young scholar, or philosopher, after all the captains were murdered in parley by treason, conducted those ten thousand foot, through the heart of all the king's high countries, from Babylon to Graecia in safety, in despite of all the king's forces, to the astonishment of the world, and the encouragement of the Grecians in time succeeding to make invasion upon the kings of Persia, as was afterwards purposed by Jason the Thessalian, attempted by Agesilaus the Spartan, and achieved by Alexander the Macedonian, all upon the ground of the act of that young scholar."

It was, I confess, with a certain amount of dismay that, when it became my duty to teach boys their Xenophon, I found that this spirited sketch of Bacon's must have its most characteristic touches blotted out; that probably it was not Xenophon at all who was the object of Phalinus's scorn; and that, if it was Xenophon, he was no youthful inexperienced scholar, but a middle-aged veteran. In the passage of the *Anabasis* referred to (ii. 1. 12), the best MSS. read *Θεόπομπος*. Krüger indeed maintains that *Ξενόφων* is the true reading, and thinks that the name *Θεόπομπος* crept into the text from a marginal note of a scholiast, which may perhaps have been *Θεόπομπος δὲ Πρόξενον τοῦτο εἰπεῖν φησί*, as in

fact the *mot* is attributed to Proxenus by Diodorus. I myself am glad to agree with Krüger in his conclusion on this point, as it is probable that the historian Theopompus in his *σύνταξις Ἑλληνικῶν* did treat at length of the expedition of Cyrus, and there is no other indication in the *Anabasis* that an Athenian of that name was present in the army. I do not, however, consider that the point I wish to establish needs any such repudiation of MS. authority; and I shall therefore leave Theopompus in the enjoyment of such credit as this single incident can give him.

The only argument adduced in support of the assumption that Xenophon was born about B. C. 444 is the fact that Strabo and Diogenes Laertius report that Xenophon was present at the battle of Delium, which occurred in the latter part of B. C. 424, and was saved in the subsequent flight by the intervention of Socrates. Strabo's story is as follows.

In his description of Boeotia, he comes to the south-easterly corner, and says: *εἴτα Δήλιον τὸ ἱερὸν τοῦ Ἀπόλλωνος ἐκ Δήλου ἀφιευμένον, Ταυαγραίων πολίχριον, Αὐλίδος διέχον σταδίους τριάκοντα, ὅπου μίχῃ ληφθέντες Ἀθηναῖοι ἔφυγον· ἐν δὲ τῇ φυγῇ πεσόντα ἀφ' ἵππου Ξενοφῶντα τὸν Γρύλλον ἰδὼν κείμενον Σωκράτης ὁ φιλόσοφος στρατεύων πεζός, τοῦ ἵππου γερονότος ἐκποδῶν, ἀνέλαβε τοῖς ὤμοις αὐτοῦ καὶ ἔσωσεν ἐπὶ πολλοὺς σταδίους, ἕως ἐπαύσατο ἡ φυγή.* (Strabo, Book ix., p. 403, Ed. Cas.) Diogenes Laertius, in his life of Socrates (ii. 22), speaks as follows: *ἐπεμελεῖτο δὲ καὶ σωμασκίας καὶ ἦν εὐέκτης. Ἐστρατεύσατο γοῦν εἰς Ἀμφίπολιν* καὶ Ξενοφῶντα ἀφ' ἵππου πεσόντα ἐν τῇ κατὰ Δήλιον μάχῃ διέσωσεν ὑπολαβὼν· ὅτε καὶ πάντων φευγόντων Ἀθηναίων, αὐτὸς ἡρέμα ἀνεχώρει, παρεπιστρεφόμενος ἡσυχῇ καὶ τηρῶν ἀμύνασθαι εἰ τίς οἱ ἐπέλθοι.*

Now, if this story is true, it is assumed that Xenophon must have been at least in his twentieth year; as youths between the ages of eighteen and twenty were formed into a kind of horse-patrol, under the name of *περίπολοι*, to guard the

*Diogenes refers here in all probability to the expedition of B. C. 432-430 against Potidaea, in the winter blockade of which place Socrates served with conspicuous hardihood. (PLAT. *Symp.* p. 220 A.) He is said to have been also on the expedition which Cleon led in B. C. 422 to attempt the recovery of Amphipolis; but, though he no doubt did his duty there as elsewhere, I can find no mention of any unusual gallantry or endurance displayed by him in that service. This may, therefore, be a further instance of the inaccuracy of Diogenes.

frontier, but were not required to serve beyond it; and, though the so-called battle of Delium was actually fought within the limits of the Athenian territory in the vicinity of Oropus, it is taken for granted that because Delium, the objective point of the expedition, was over the boundary, Xenophon could not have been permitted to take part in it unless he had passed beyond the age of the *περίπολοι*. But, when you read the narrative of Thucydides, and remember that Delium was only about a mile from the border territory of Oropus, and Oropus itself only a day's march from Athens, you feel that Grote has good ground for saying, as he does, that "it is probable that men of all ages, arms, and dispositions crowded to join the march, in part from mere curiosity and excitement." Assuming, therefore, for the moment the truth of the story in Diogenes, Xenophon may well have been from five to ten years younger than it is asserted that he was at the time of the battle of Delium; and this reasoning of mine should find favor with those who wish to accept the literal truth of Strabo's statement that Socrates took him on his shoulders, and carried him safely for several stades.

But this conjecture is in my judgment by no means sufficient to harmonize the story with the passages I shall presently quote from the *Anabasis*; and I am forced, therefore, to discredit it altogether. No doubt both Strabo and Diogenes found the fact asserted in the authorities they consulted. But you must remember that Strabo was a contemporary of Augustus, and lived certainly some years into the reign of Tiberius; while Diogenes probably flourished at the close of the second century after Christ, and is by some placed as low as the time of Constantine. Strabo was no doubt accurate and painstaking in the verification of his statements as to matters of geography; but such stories as the one in question were probably introduced into his account by way of enlivening it and without any special examination into their truth or falsehood. It was enough for him that such a story was current in reference to the locality to warrant him in inserting it. Diogenes, however, was eminently uncritical. The writer of his life in *Smith's Dictionary* (Adolf Stahr) says of him:

“His work is in reality nothing but a compilation of the most heterogeneous and often directly contradictory accounts, put together without plan, criticism, or connection.” “His object evidently was to furnish a book which was to amuse its readers by piquant anecdotes.” “The traces of carelessness and mistakes are very numerous; much in the work is confused, and there is also much which is quite absurd.” “In order to rescue the common sense of the writer, critics have had recourse to the hypothesis that the present work is a mutilated abridgment of the original production of Diogenes.” I maintain, therefore, that an anecdote which we find introduced incidentally into the work of a geographer who lived four hundred years after the time of the alleged occurrence, and into the work of an uncritical biographer of philosophers who lived at least six hundred years after it, is not to be accepted as true, if there is any considerable weight of probability against it, and much less so if the acceptance of it renders several statements in the writings of the subject of the anecdote preposterous and absurd.

First, then, as to the antecedent improbability of Xenophon's having been present, under the circumstances supposed, at the battle of Delium.

1. The story is not perhaps irreconcilable, but it is certainly not in obvious accord, with the fact stated in Plutarch's life of Alcibiades, that “in the battle of Delium, when the Athenians were routed, and Socrates with a few others were retreating on foot, Alcibiades, who was on horseback, observing it, would not pass on, but stayed to shelter him from the danger, and brought him safe off, though the enemy pressed hard upon them and cut many off.” The natural inference from this would be that Socrates had quite enough to do to save himself, and was not in a condition to take on his shoulders a young man of twenty, and walk off with him for several stades.*

* It is notable that Krüger is inclined to question the accuracy of this narrative of Plutarch, on the ground that Alcibiades, in *Plato's* “Banquet” (pp. 220, 221), when he is represented as pronouncing his panegyric on Socrates, does not claim to have contributed anything to his safety. But Krüger has not a word to say about the singular fact that Xenophon, in *his own* *Memorabilia*, makes no allusion

2. On the assumption that Xenophon was of military age at the time of the battle of Delium, where was he and what was he doing during the remaining twenty years of the war? It is hard to believe that a man of such remarkable resource and practical efficiency should have remained unemployed during all the exciting scenes of the Sicilian expedition and on the coast of Asia Minor; and it is nearly as incredible that, if he had been engaged in those affairs, he would have told us nothing about them himself (for reticence about his own achievements is certainly not to be attributed to him), or that we should have had no notices of his adventures from other sources.

3. It is highly improbable that, if he had been indebted for the saving of his life to Socrates, we should have had no intimation of so striking a fact in any of his numerous writings, particularly when one of them is expressly devoted to the vindication of the character of Socrates as in all respects a good citizen.

4. Lucian (in his *Μακρόβιοι*, §21) states that Xenophon lived beyond his ninetieth year. This may very well be the case. But it is hard to believe that he could have maintained to the verge of that age so much literary activity as he was exhibiting at or after the date of the battle of Mantinea, B. C. 362. The narrative of the *Hellenica* is continued to that date, when he must have been, according to the common view, eighty-two years old. But this is not all; for in *Hell.* vi. 4. 35, the assassination of Alexander of Pherae is mentioned, which Clinton and Grote place in B. C. 359, when Xenophon would have been eighty-five years old, and Diodorus places three years later; and at the end of the chapter an expression is used which would suggest that a considerable interval elapsed between the murder and the writing of the narrative: τῶν δὲ ταῦτα πραξάντων ἄχρις οὗ ὅδε ὁ λόγος ἐγράφετο Τισίφονος πρεσβύτατος ὧν τῶν ἀεελφῶν τὴν ἀρχὴν εἶχε. Moreover, the last chapter of the *Cyropaedia*, called the *Epilogus*, which,

to his own supposed debt to Socrates. Krüger does not observe, moreover, that in the "Banquet," though Alcibiades describes Socrates's dauntless bearing in the face of the foe, he does not mention his having Xenophon on his back, which would have surely enhanced greatly the noteworthiness of the scene.

though its genuineness has been questioned, is now, I believe, generally recognized as a fitting conclusion to the book, speaks of events connected with the revolt of certain satraps from Artaxerxes Mnemon, which occurred B. C. 361; and Xenophon undoubtedly wrote his *Hipparchicus* and his *Poroï* after the repeal of the decree for his banishment, which Krüger places in the same year as the battle of Mantinea, B. C. 362. He must, therefore, have been engaged on at least four of his works after he was, as is generally assumed, eighty-two years old; I say 'at least,' for the passage at the beginning of the third book of the *Hellenica*, in which Xenophon speaks of an account of the expedition and retreat of the Greeks having been written by a certain Themistogenes of Syracuse, induces Schneider to conclude decisively that the *Anabasis* was written after the *Hellenica*. This, however, is very doubtful on other grounds.

5. Photius states that Xenophon was a pupil of Isocrates, who was born B. C. 436. This may be true, as George Long (in Smith's Dict.) says; but, if it is true, it is at least exceedingly improbable that Xenophon should have been born eight years before his future teacher.

I now pass to the passages in the *Anabasis* which bear upon the question, and which seem to me to prove that if Xenophon was at the battle of Delium at all, he must have been so in the same sense as that in which in the Scripture Levi is said to have paid tithes to Melchisedec.*

1. In the last chapter of Book ii. we are told that of the five generals who were assassinated, Proxenus was about thirty years old (*ἐτῶν ὡς τριάκοντα*), Clearchus about fifty (*ἑμφὶ τὰ πεντήκοντα ἔτη*), while Agias and Socrates were about thirty-five (*ἵσστην ἑμφω ἑμφὶ τὰ πέντε καὶ τριάκοντα ἔτη ἀπὸ γενεῆς*). Menon's age is not mentioned; but it may be inferred from what is stated that he was considerably younger than any of the others. Now Xenophon joined the expedition through the influence of Proxenus, who was, according to the view I am criticizing, his junior by thirteen years. It is antecedently improbable that influence such as this would have been exerted

* Heb. vii. 9, 10.

by a young man upon one so much his senior. But omitting this point, with which circumstances may have had something to do, it is at least certain that Xenophon must have been perfectly familiar with the phenomenon of men of thirty or thirty-five years of age discharging the functions of generals, and he could not, therefore, if he were older than this, have appeared to himself too young to exercise such functions. It is of course true that, in case of an election of their commander by the soldiers, a man of mature years and an experienced veteran would, other things being equal, be preferred to a mere youth of no recognized preëminence. But, in the absence of any *lex annalis* to control them, soldiers in such a strait as the Greeks were in would be likely to yield submission to the man, whatever were his age, who seemed to possess in the highest degree the qualities needed for their deliverance; and certainly if they were, as was the case with Proxenus's officers, accustomed to obey a man of thirty, they would not be likely to look upon a man of forty-three as too young for the position. But what does Xenophon say (iii. 1. 14) when he tells us his meditations after awaking from his dream? "No one," he says, "is taking any thought about our dangers. Why do I wait for the general of some other city to undertake these things? and what age do I expect to come to myself? for I shall not be any older if I give myself up to the enemy to-day"; or, as Grote puts it, "Why do I wait for any man older than myself or for any man of a different city to begin (ποίαν δ' ἡλικίαν ἐμαντῶ ἐλθεῖν ἀναμένω; οὐ γὰρ ἔγωγ' ἔτι πρεσβύτερος ἔσομαι, εἴαν τήμερον προδῶ ἐμαντὸν τοῖς πολεμίοις)? Here the word ἡλικίαν, which by itself implies simply 'time of life,' is confined to the notion of 'youth' by the subsequent πρεσβύτερος.

2. When Xenophon has roused the captains of Proxenus, and has expressed to them his anxiety and his views as to the proper course to be pursued, he says (iii. 1. 24; I use again Grote's adaptation): "Let us not wait for any one else to come as monitor to us; let us take the lead, and communicate the stimulus of honor to others. Do you show yourselves now the best of the lochages, more worthy of being generals

than the generals themselves. Begin at once, and I desire only to follow you. But if you order me into the front rank, I shall obey without pleading my youth as an excuse, accounting myself of complete maturity, when the purpose is to save myself from ruin" (iii. 1. 25, *κἀγὼ δέ, εἰ μὲν ὑμεῖς ἐθέλετε ἔξορμᾶν ἐπὶ ταῦτα, ἔπεσθαι ὑμῖν βούλομαι· εἰ δ' ὑμεῖς τάττετέ με ἡγεῖσθαι, οὐδὲν προφασίζομαι τὴν ἡλικίαν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀκμάζειν ἡγοῦμαι ἐρύκειν ἀπ' ἑμαντοῦ τὰ κακά*). How absurd would it have appeared to Proxenus's captains, accustomed as they were to obey the commands of a man of thirty, to hear a man of forty-three suggesting that perhaps he might appear to them too young to act as their leader!

3. After suggesting the best formation for the army on its march, Xenophon proposes that the officers who are to command on each quarter shall be at once selected, and says: "Let Cheirisophus lead the van, since he is a Lacedaemonian; and let two of the oldest generals have charge of the two wings; and let me and Timasion, who are the younger, guard the rear" (iii. 2. 37, *ὀπισθοφυλακῶμεν δὲ ἡμεῖς οἱ νεώτεροι, ἐγὼ τε καὶ Τιμασίων, τὸ νῦν εἶναι*). We are not told the ages of the generals who were chosen to fill the places of those who had been murdered; but it is exceedingly improbable that they were all over forty;* and yet they must have been considerably so, if Xenophon, being forty-three, could speak of himself as younger than they.

4. When it is necessary to make a supreme effort to gain a certain height, in order to dislodge the enemy from their threatening position, Xenophon, discussing the matter with Cheirisophus, says that he will either take command of the force which is to scale the height or stay with the army in the plain, and Cheirisophus, not to be outdone in generosity, replies: "Well, I allow you to choose which you please"; and then we are told that "Xenophon, saying that he is the younger, elects to go" (iii. 4. 42, *εἰπὼν ὁ Ξενοφῶν ὅτι νεώτερός ἐστιν, αἰρεῖται πορεύεσθαι*). Here again there is the same assertion

*It is proper to say that Krüger assumes the truth of this improbability, and, if I understand him, believes it likely that the rank and file of the army also consisted of men over forty. I do not think that many who consider the circumstances under which the Cyreian force was collected will agree with him.

of comparative youthfulness, which would have seemed impertinent and ridiculous in a man of middle age.

5. When the Greeks had reached Trapezus, and, after vainly waiting for a number of vessels sufficient to transport the whole army, decided that they must make a move, they placed on board the ships which they had secured the feeble and *those above forty years* with the children and women, and they placed Philesius and Sophænetus, the eldest of the generals, in charge of them (v. 3. 1, καὶ εἰς μὲν τὰ πλοῖα τοὺς τε ἀσθενούντας ἐνεβύβασαν καὶ τοὺς ὑπὲρ τετταράκοντα ἔτη καὶ παῖδας καὶ γυναῖκας—καὶ Φιλήσιον καὶ Σοφαίνετον, τοὺς πρεσβυτάτους τῶν στρατηγῶν, εἰσβυβάσαντες τούτων ἐκέλευον ἐπιμελεῖσθαι). Here it is to be observed that it is manifest that only a small number of men in the army were as old as forty years; for they had only a small number of vessels, and the subsequent fighting strength of the enemy was not seriously lessened; and that two of the other generals are distinctly spoken of as older than their brother officers.

6. On a certain occasion, Neon, who was in command of the division of Cheirisophus, when the army was in great straits for provisions, led out two thousand volunteers for an attack on some Bithynian villages, though the sacrifices persisted in presenting unfavorable indications. Subsequently his force was surprised by the horsemen of Pharnabazus, and five hundred of them were cut off, and the rest took refuge on a mountain. On hearing this, Xenophon, first sacrificing one of the baggage oxen, hurried to their aid, and with him all the others up to thirty years (vi. 4. 25, ἐβρόθήει καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι οἱ μέχρι τριάκοντα ἔτων ἅπαντες). One would naturally infer from this that Xenophon did not appear conspicuously unequal to his comrades, as he would have done if he had been nearly forty-five years old. For in the following chapter (vi. 5. 4) we are told that after this reverse the generals organized an expedition for forage, leaving the slaves and mixed multitude (τὸν ὄχλον καὶ τὰ ἀνδράποδα) in a strongly fortified camp with Neon to guard it (οἱ μὲν δὲ ἄλλοι πάντες ἐξῆλθον, Νέων δὲ οὗ· ἐδόκει γὰρ κάλλιστον εἶναι τοῦτον φύλακα καταλιπεῖν τῶν ἐπὶ τὸ στρατόπεδον).

And then it is said* that when Neon's captains and soldiers, feeling ashamed to stay behind when the rest had gone forth, left those who were in the camp with Neon, then all went forth on the expedition, and only those were left behind who were more than forty-five years old (*κατέλιπον αὐτοῦ τοὺς ὑπὲρ πέντε καὶ τετταράκοντα ἔτη*), from which we may gather that an age such as is commonly attributed to Xenophon was generally regarded as affording some justification for a certain remissness and willingness to be behind a rampart.

7. After the Greeks had taken service with Seuthes, when it was necessary to make a very rapid attack, Xenophon dismounted from his horse, and on being asked why he did so, replied that the hoplites would run faster and more cheerfully if he led them on foot; and then it is said that Xenophon ordered the men who were not over thirty to join him from the companies, and that he himself ran fast with these, while Cleonor (who is mentioned in ii. 1. 10 as *πρεσβύτατος ὢν*) led the rest of the Greeks (vii. 3. 46, *Ξενοφῶν δὲ παρηγγύησε τοὺς εἰς τριάκοντα ἔτη παριέναι ἀπὸ τῶν λόχων εὐζώνους. καὶ αὐτὸς μὲν ἐτρόχαζε τοὺς ἔχων· Κλεάνωρ δ' ἡγεῖτο τῶν ἄλλων Ἑλλήνων*). Here again the natural inference is that Xenophon was certainly not inferior in bodily activity to those who were under thirty, and that therefore he was himself probably under thirty.

There are several other passages which I might quote, in which, though he says nothing by which his own age is directly implied, he calls attention to the fact that others are of more or less advanced ages (*πρεσβύτεροι* or *πρεσβύτατοι*). Now I think that this is of itself an indication of youthfulness on the part of the person who so speaks or writes. For as it cannot be supposed that there were any in the army who were what we should call really old men, it would be an impertinence for a person who was himself forty-three years old to talk about his comrades so readily as Xenophon does as being "older" or "oldest."

There is only one passage in the *Anabasis* which is supposed

*This passage is a little obscure. I give substantially the interpretation of Kühner and Freund.

to imply that Xenophon was a man of mature years. It is when Seuthes, among other fair promises by which he hoped to induce Xenophon to engage the Greek army to take service with him, says: "And to you, Xenophon, I will give a daughter of mine; and if you have a daughter, I will buy her after the Thracian manner" (vii. 2. 38, σοὶ δὲ, ὦ Ξενοφῶν, καὶ θυγατέρα δώσω, καί, εἴ τις σοὶ ἔστι θυγάτηρ, ὠνήσομαι Θρακίῳ νόμῳ). This, it is said, implies that Xenophon must have seemed to Seuthes old enough to have a marriageable daughter. But no such inference is necessary. For anything we know to the contrary, Xenophon, though as young as I think he was, may have been bronzed by the hardship and exposure he had encountered during the previous months so as to look as old as Krüger makes him; or Seuthes may have thought that perhaps he had an infant daughter whom he might purchase, in eastern fashion, for his harem; or, more probable than either of these suppositions, it may have been an offer made as recklessly and with as little thought or care for the possibility of its fulfillment as any other of the engagements which Seuthes entered into at the same time. There is, moreover, a passage subsequently (vii. 6. 34) in which Xenophon implies distinctly that he had no children at that time.

My own strong impression is that Xenophon was under twenty-five at the time of the Anabasis, though, of course, I do not pretend to have established anything so precise as this; and that, therefore, whether it was Xenophon or a certain Theopompus at whom the repartee of Phalinus was aimed, we may still allow the account of scorn and wonder to stand as Bacon puts it. If we believe that Xenophon was a mere youth, the remarks which Grote makes on the superiority of Athenian training as compared with that of other parts of Greece will be felt to be more strikingly appropriate; and I quote a few lines of them in order to call due attention to the personal qualities which Xenophon possessed, and which secured the admission of his superiority notwithstanding his apparent youthfulness. Grote says, in his account of the ready way in which Xenophon's suggestions were adopted: "Cheirisophus had not only been before in office as one of

the generals, but he was also a native of Sparta, whose supremacy and name were at that moment all-powerful. Kleonor had been before, not indeed a general, but a lochage, or one in the second rank of officers. He was an elderly man, and he was an Arcadian, while more than the numerical half of the army consisted of Arcadians and Achaeans. Either of these two, therefore, and various others besides, enjoyed a sort of prerogative or established starting-point for taking the initiative in reference to the dispirited army. But Xenophon was comparatively a young man — I should say, a very young man — “with little military experience. He was not an officer at all. He had nothing to start with except his personal qualities and previous training.” “In him are exemplified those peculiarities of Athens — spontaneous and forward impulse as well in conception as in execution, confidence under circumstances which made others despair, persuasive discourse and publicity of discussion made subservient to practical business, so as at once to appeal to the intelligence, and stimulate the active zeal, of the multitude.” “The Athenian Xenophon was among the few who could think, speak, and act with equal efficiency.” “It was this tripartite accomplishment, the exclusive possession of which, in spite of constant jealousy on the part of the Boeotian officers and comrades of Proxenus, elevated Xenophon into the most ascendent position in the Cyreian army.”

VIII. — *Φύσει or Θέσει — Natural or Conventional?*

BY WILLIAM D. WHITNEY,

PROFESSOR OF SANSKRIT AND COMPARATIVE PHILOLOGY IN YALE COLLEGE.

THE Greeks, it is well known, disputed of old with one another whether the names of things existed *φύσει*, ‘by nature,’ or *θέσει*, ‘by attribution’ — that is, as we should say, ‘by convention.’ Into the history of this dispute, into the question as to what philosophers took ground on the one side and on the other, with what arguments they supported their views, and how near they came to a final agreement, there